

**Court of Appeals, Division One**

**Civil - Family Court**

**1 CA-CV 21-0661 FC**

**KUMBERA v. MANICKAM**

**Appellate Case Information**

Case Filed: 16-Nov-2021

Case Closed:

**Dept/Composition**

**Department F**

Hon. Jennifer B Campbell  
 Hon. Kent E Cattani  
 Hon. Anni Hill Foster

**Side 1. In re the Marriage of:**

**SANTOSH KUMBERA, Petitioner/Appellee**

(Litigant Group) **SANTOSH KUMBERA**

- Santosh Kumbera

**Co-Counsel Attorneys for: Petitioner/Appellee**

Edward Jakob Walneck, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 32629)

**Side 2. SUNDARI MANICKAM, Respondent/Appellant**

(Litigant Group) **SUNDARI MANICKAM**

- Sundari Manickam

**Co Counsel for: Respondent/Appellant**

Regina M Pangerl, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 23395)

Paul C Riggs, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 12330)

**CASE STATUS**

Dec 14, 2023....Under Advisement

PREDECESSOR CASE(S)	Cause/Charge/Class	Judgment/Sentence	Judge, Role <Comments>	Trial	Dispo
MAR FC2019-095961	Decree of Dissolution of Marriage		David E McDowell, Authoring Judge of Order		

**CALENDAR**

Thursday	MONTHLY COURT CASE CALENDAR	CV Cases
<b>14-Dec-2023</b>	<b>Department F; COURTROOM 2</b>	
10:15 AM	SUNDARI MANICKAM.....	20 mins.
	SANTOSH KUMBERA.....	20 mins.

**84 PROCEEDING ENTRIES**

- 16-Nov-2021 FILED: Appellant's Motion to Revest Superior Court with Jurisdiction to Rule on Emergency Motion to Freeze Marital Community's Financial Accounts; Certificate of Service of "Motion to Revest Superior Court with Jurisdiction to Rule on Emergency Motion to Freeze Marital Community's Financial Accounts" (Appellant)
- 18-Nov-2021 ORDERED: The court will rule on the motion to revest jurisdiction following expiration of the time for a response and, if applicable, a reply. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
- 19-Nov-2021 RECEIPT No.: 2021-01248 ; \$280.00, Authorization: Ref1:22027088525, Applied to: SUNDARI MANICKAM - Class A Filing Fee (\$280.00) Paid for: Pangerl Law Firm PLLC - By nCourt LLC
- 24-Nov-2021 FILED: Additional Record on Appeal: Exhibits: Hearing Date 12/2/19 List and #10, 11, 12, 15, 16, 17, 21, 22, 23 in manila envelope; Hearing Date 8/2/21 List and # 87, 201, 204, 205, 206, 207, 208, 209, 210, 211, 212, 281, 282, 283, 284 in manila envelope
- 29-Nov-2021 FILED: e-Record on Appeal: Instruments/Minute Entries Exhibits: Hearing Date 8/2/21 1, 2, 3, 4, 7, 8, 9, 13, 14, 16, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 46, 47, 50, 52, 53, 54, 55, 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 61, 62, 63, 64, 65, 66, 67, 68, 69, 70, 71, 72, 73, 74, 75, 76, 77, 78, 79, 92, 114, 116, 117, 120, 126, 133, 134, 135, 136, 137, 138, 139, 14, 141, 142, 143, 149, 150, 151, 152, 153, 154, 157, 160, 161, 162, 163, 167, 168, 169, 170, 172, 173, 185, 189, 191, 193, 195, 197, 213, 217, 218, 221, 222, 225, 230, 231, 232
- 29-Nov-2021 FILED: Index of Record, Notice of Appeal filed in Maricopa County Superior Court on 10/27/2021; Amended Notice of Appeal filed in Maricopa County Superior Court on 10/29/2021.
- 1-Dec-2021 FILED: Notice of Appearance; Certificate of Service (Appellee)
- 1-Dec-2021 FILED: Objection to Appellant's Motion to Revest Jurisdiction with the Superior Court; Certificate of Service; Exhibit A (Appellee)
- 7-Dec-2021 RECEIPT No.: 2021-01299 ; \$140.00, Authorization: #41004828342, Applied to: SANTOSH KUMBERA - Class B Filing Fee (\$140.00) Paid for: Loose Law Group PC - By nCourt LLC

**Court of Appeals, Division One****Civil - Family Court****1 CA-CV 21-0661 FC****KUMBERA v. MANICKAM****84 PROCEEDING ENTRIES**

10. 8-Dec-2021 FILED: Appellee's Motion to Revest Jurisdiction with the Superior Court; Certificate of Service; Exhibits A-C (Appellee)
11. 9-Dec-2021 ORDERED: Appellant's Motion to Revest Superior Court with Jurisdiction to Rule on Emergency Motion to Freeze Marital Community's Financial Accounts (Appellant) and Appellee's Motion to Revest Jurisdiction with the Superior Court (Appellee) = GRANTED and, pursuant to Arizona Rule of Civil Appellate Procedure 3(b), staying appeal until 01/11/2022. FURTHER ORDERED: Revesting jurisdiction in Maricopa County Superior Court and authorizing that court to consider the emergency motion to freeze financial accounts and the motion for clarification of the decree. FURTHER ORDERED: Stay will be lifted automatically on 01/11/2022, unless before that date, either party files a motion to continue stay of appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: Within 10 days after superior court rules on either motion, appellant must file a notice in this court with the ruling attached. FURTHER ORDERED: Case management statement due 01/21/2022, and opening brief due 02/14/2022. Barbara Vidal Vaught ProTem Judge - Author
12. 29-Dec-2021 FILED: Appellee's Second Motion to Revest Jurisdiction with the Superior Court; Certificate of Service; Exhibit A (Appellee)
13. 30-Dec-2021 FILED: Supplemented Superior Court e-Record with Revised Index of Record [includes an ME: Order Entered by Court [12/16/2021], and Ruling [12/16/2021]]
14. 11-Jan-2022 FILED: Motion to Continue Stay; Certificate of Service; Exhibit A (Appellee)
15. 12-Jan-2022 ORDERED: Appellee's Second Motion to Revest Jurisdiction with the Superior Court (Appellee) = DENIED. FURTHER ORDERED: Motion to Continue Stay = GRANTED and continuing stay of appeal until 02/11/2022 for the purposes set forth in this court's 12/09/2021 stay order. FURTHER ORDERED: Stay will be lifted automatically on 02/11/2022 unless before that date appellee files a motion to continue stay of appeal that describes status of the motion for clarification. FURTHER ORDERED: Within 10 days after superior court rules on motion, appellee must file a notice in this court with the ruling attached. FURTHER ORDERED: If a party wants this court to review any additional rulings, that party must file a timely notice of appeal or amended notice of appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: Case management statement due 02/22/2022, and opening brief due 03/14/2022. Barbara Vidal Vaught ProTem Judge - Author
16. 11-Feb-2022 FILED: Supplemented Superior Court e-Record with Revised Index of Record [includes ME: Ruling [01/19/2022] and ME: Ruling [01/27/2022]]
17. 17-Feb-2022 ORDERED: Continuing stay of appeal until 04/18/2022, to allow superior court to fully resolve motion for clarification and enter any orders relating to division of the business. FURTHER ORDERED: Superior court may in its discretion hold an evidentiary hearing and may direct parties to file any pleadings or documents it deems necessary to resolve motion for clarification. FURTHER ORDERED: Directing appellee to file notice in this court with a copy of ruling on motion for clarification within 10 days after its entry. FURTHER ORDERED: If a party wants this court to review any additional rulings, that party must file a timely notice of appeal or amended notice of appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: If superior court modifies dissolution decree from which appellant appeals, appellant must file a timely notice of appeal from such order or decree. FURTHER ORDERED: If superior court has not resolved motion for clarification by 04/18/2022, appellee must file a notice in this court regarding status of motion. FURTHER ORDERED: Vacating 02/22/2022 due date for case management statement and 03/14/2022 due date for opening brief. Court will address briefing schedule after superior court rules on motion for clarification. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
18. 4-Mar-2022 FILED: Supplemented Superior Court e-Record with Revised Index of Record [includes Notice of Appeal, ME: Hearing Set [02/23/2022], Mother's Second Amended Notice of Appeal, and ME: Order Entered by Court [03/03/2022]]
19. 14-Mar-2022 FILED: Supplemented Superior Court e-Record with Revised Index of Record [including ME: Order Entered by Court [03/11/2022]]
20. 20-Apr-2022 FILED: Notice of Superior Court's Ruling; Certificate of Service; Copy of MAR County Superior Court ME Order filed 04/18/2022 re: Ruling Dividing the Parties' Business (Appellee)
21. 22-Apr-2022 FILED: Supplemented Superior Court e-Record with Revised Index of Record [includes ME: Ruling Matter Under Advisement [04/11/2022], ME: Order Entered by Court [04/07/2022]]
22. 25-Apr-2022 ORDERED: Lifting stay of appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: Case management statement due 05/05/2022, and opening brief due 05/25/2022. Barbara Vidal Vaught ProTem Judge - Author
23. 3-May-2022 FILED: Appellant/Mother's Motion to Stay the Appellate Proceedings & Revest Jurisdiction in the Trial Court and Motion for Extension of Time to File Opening Brief; Certificate of Service re: Motion to Stay the Appellate Proceedings & Revest Jurisdiction in the Trial Court and Motion for Extension of Time to File Opening Brief (Appellant)
24. 4-May-2022 ORDERED: Appellant/Mother's Motion to Stay the Appellate Proceedings & Revest Jurisdiction in the Trial Court and Motion for Extension of Time to File Opening Brief (Appellant) = GRANTED and staying appeal until 06/24/2022, to allow superior court to resolve pending attorney fees claims. FURTHER ORDERED: Stay will be lifted automatically on 06/24/2022, unless before that date appellant files motion to continue stay of appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: Reminding appellant that she must file timely notice of appeal from 04/20/2022 ME. FURTHER ORDERED: Case management statement due on 07/05/2022, and opening brief due 07/25/2022. Barbara Vidal Vaught ProTem Judge - Author
25. 6-May-2022 FILED: Supplemented Superior Court e-Record with Revised Index of Record [includes Mother's Third Amended Notice of Appeal; ME: Ruling [04/25/2022]; Mother's Fourth Amended Notice of Appeal]

**Court of Appeals, Division One****Civil - Family Court****1 CA-CV 21-0661 FC****KUMBERA v. MANICKAM****84 PROCEEDING ENTRIES**

26. 9-May-2022 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 08/02/2021 - Trial-Day 1 (Angela Furniss Miller)
27. 9-May-2022 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 08/03/2021 - Trial-Day 2 (Angela Furniss Miller)
28. 24-May-2022 FILED: Supplemented Superior Court e-Record with Revised Index of Record [includes Mother's Fifth Amended Notice of Appeal; Mother's Notice of Appeal Re: Ruling Entered on April 20, 2022 (4/20/22)]
29. 7-Jun-2022 FILED: Appellant/Mother's Motion to Continue Stay; Certificate of Service re: Motion to Continue Stay (Appellant)
30. 7-Jun-2022 FILED: Certificate of Service re: Motion to Continue Stay (Appellant)
31. 8-Jun-2022 ORDERED: Appellant/Mother's Motion to Continue Stay (Appellant) = GRANTED and continuing the stay until 9/1/22. FURTHER ORDERED: stay will be lifted automatically on 9/1/22 unless appellant files motion to continue stay. FURTHER ORDERED: within 10 days after superior court resolves attorney's fees issues/passport petition, appellant must file notice in this court with rulings attached. FURTHER ORDERED: if a party wants this court to review any additional rulings, the party must file a timely notice of appeal or amended notice of appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: case management statement due 9/12/22, opening brief due 10/03/22. Barbara Vidal Vaught ProTem Judge - Author
32. 24-Aug-2022 FILED: Appellant/Mother's Notice of Post-Decree Final Orders Being Issued; Certificate of Service Re: Notice of Post-Decree Final Orders Being Issued (Appellant)
33. 24-Aug-2022 FILED: Appellant/Mother's Notice of Filing Trial Court Orders; Certificate of Service Re: Notice of Filing Trial Court Orders; Copy of MAR County Superior Court ME Ruling filed 08/09/2022 re: Ruling on Five Motions, Petitions, and Requests (Appellant)
34. 25-Aug-2022 ORDERED: Lifting stay of appeal. Parties are reminded that if they want court to review any additional rulings, timely notice of appeal or amended notice of appeal must be filed. FURTHER ORDERED: Case management statement due 09/12/2022, and opening brief due 10/03/2022. Barbara Vidal Vaught - Author
35. 2-Sep-2022 FILED: Appellant/Mother's Motion for Stay and Motion for Extension of Time to File Opening Brief; Certificate of Service re: Motion for Stay and Motion for Extension to File Opening Brief; Exhibits 1-2 (Appellant)
36. 2-Sep-2022 FILED: Supplemented Superior Court e-Record with Revised Index of Record [ME: Judgment/Decree [08/04/2022]]
37. 6-Sep-2022 ORDERED: Vacating 10/03/2022 due date for opening brief. Order ruling on pending motion for stay and extension will set due date to file opening brief. Barbara Vidal Vaught ProTem Judge - Author
38. 7-Sep-2022 FILED: Objection to Appellant's Motion for Stay and Motion for Extension of Time to File Opening Brief; Certificate of Service (Appellee)
39. 7-Sep-2022 FILED: Appellant/Mother's Notice of Filing Motion for Reconsideration in the Trial Court; Certificate of Service re: Notice of Filing Motion for Reconsideration in the Trial Court; (Untitled) Exhibit 1 (Appellant)
40. 11-Sep-2022 FILED: Case Management Statement (Appellant)
41. 13-Sep-2022 FILED: Appellant/Mother's Reply to Appellee/Father's Objection/Response to Mother's Motion for Extension of Time to File Opening Brief; Certificate of Service re: Mother's Reply to Father's Objection/Response to Mother's Motion for Stay and Motion for Extension to File Opening Brief; Exhibits 1-6 (Appellant)
42. 20-Sep-2022 ORDERED: Appellant/Mother's Motion for Stay and Motion for Extension of Time to File Opening Brief (Appellant) = GRANTED and staying appeal until 10/31/2022, revesting jurisdiction in superior court for purpose of permitting that court to consider pending motion for reconsideration. FURTHER ORDERED: Stay will be lifted automatically on 10/31/2022 unless before, appellant files motion to continue the stay of appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: Opening brief due 12/06/2022. No extensions will be granted. FURTHER ORDERED: Denying both parties' requests for attorney's fees and costs in connection with motion. Hon Kent E Cattani - Author
43. 5-Oct-2022 FILED: Notice of Superior Court's Ruling; Certificate of Service; Exhibit A (Appellee)
44. 5-Oct-2022 FILED: Appellant/Mother's Notice to Court Re Transcript Update and Re Trial Court Orders; Certificate of Service Re: Mother's Notice to Court Re Transcripts and Re Trial Court Order; Copy of MAR County Superior Court ME filed 09/20/2020 re: Denying Motion for Reconsideration (Appellant)
45. 5-Oct-2022 FILED: Appellant/Mother's Notice to Court Re: Transcript Update and Re: Trial Court Orders; Certificate of Service Re: Mother's Notice to Court Re Transcripts and Re Trial Court Order (Appellant)
46. 7-Oct-2022 ORDERED: Lifting stay of appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: Pursuant to 09/20/2022 stay order, opening brief due 12/06/2022. If opening brief is not timely filed, court will dismiss appeal. Benjamin A Armstrong ProTem Judge - Author
47. 15-Oct-2022 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 01/25/2022 - Evidentiary Hearing (Angela Miller)
48. 15-Oct-2022 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 04/11/2022 - Evidentiary Hearing (Angela Miller)

**Court of Appeals, Division One****Civil - Family Court****1 CA-CV 21-0661 FC****KUMBERA v. MANICKAM****84 PROCEEDING ENTRIES**

49. 15-Oct-2022 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 07/25/2022 - Evidentiary Hearing (Angela Miller)
50. 9-Nov-2022 FILED: Supplemented Superior Court e-Record with Revised Index of Record (Includes Signed Minute Entry filed 9/20/2022 Re Denial of Motion for Reconsideration)
51. 28-Nov-2022 FILED: Appellant/Mother's Motion for Enlargement of Opening and Answering Briefs; Certificate of Service Re: Mother's Motion for Enlargement of Briefs; Exhibit 1 to Mother's Motion for Enlargement of Briefs (Opening & Answering Briefs) (Appellant)
52. 1-Dec-2022 ORDERED: Appellant/Mother's Motion for Enlargement of Opening and Answering Briefs (Appellant) = GRANTED in part and allowing the parties to file opening and answering briefs containing up to 18,000 words. Hon Kent E Cattani - Author
53. 6-Dec-2022 FILED: Appellant's Opening Brief; Certificate of Compliance Re: Mother's Opening Brief; Certificate of Service Re: Mother's Opening Brief (Appellant)
54. 14-Dec-2022 FILED: Transcript of Proceedings December 2, 2019 (Appellant)  
[Stricken per Order filed 12/15/2022]
55. 15-Dec-2022 ORDERED: Striking the transcript of the 12/02/2019 proceeding. Barbara Vidal Vaught - Author
56. 15-Dec-2022 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 12/02/2019 - Temporary Orders Hearing (Katherine McNally) (Appellant)
57. 9-Jan-2023 FILED: Appellee's Motion for an Extension of Time to File Answering Brief; Certificate of Service (Appellee)
58. 11-Jan-2023 ORDERED: Appellee's Motion for an Extension of Time to File Answering Brief (Appellee) = GRANTED. Due date EXTENDED from Tuesday, 01-17-2023 to Thursday, 02-16-2023. If the brief is not timely filed, the court will submit this appeal for decision on the record and the opening brief. Barbara Vidal Vaught - Author
59. 14-Feb-2023 FILED: Appellant/Mother's Expedited Motion To File Amended Opening Brief; Certificate Of Service And Certificate Of Compliance Re: Mother's Amended Opening Brief; Exhibit 2; Exhibit 1 (Appellants Amended Opening Brief) (Appellant)
60. 14-Feb-2023 ORDERED: Denying the request for an expedited ruling. The court will rule on the motion following expiration of the time for a response and, if applicable, a reply. FURTHER ORDERED: Vacating the 02/16/2023 due date for the answering brief. The order ruling on the pending motion to file an amended opening brief will set a due date to file the answering brief. Barbara Vidal Vaught - Author
61. 1-Mar-2023 FILED: Appellee's Response and Objection to Appellant's Expedited Motion to File Amended Opening Brief; Certificate of Service (Appellee)
62. 8-Mar-2023 FILED: Appellant/Mother's Reply To Mother's Expedited Motion To File Amended Opening Brief; Certificate Of Service And Certificate Of Compliance Re: Mother's Reply To Father's Response To Mother's Motion For Leave To File Amended Opening Brief (Appellant)
63. 10-Mar-2023 ORDERED: Appellant/Mother's Expedited Motion To File Amended Opening Brief (Appellant) = DENIED. FURTHER ORDERED: Denying both parties' requests for an award of attorneys' fees and costs in connection with the motion. FURTHER ORDERED: The answering brief is due by 03/31/2023. Hon Kent E Cattani - Author
64. 1-Apr-2023 FILED: Answering Brief of Petitioner/Appellee Santosh Kumbera; Certificate of Compliance for Answering Brief of Petitioner/Appellee Santosh Kumbera; Certificate of Service for Answering Brief of Petitioner/Appellee Santosh Kumbera (Appellee)
65. 12-Apr-2023 FILED: Appellant/Mother's Unopposed Motion For Enlargement Of Reply Brief; Certificate Of Service And Re: Mother's Unopposed Motion For Extension To File Reply Brief; Exhibit 1 (Appellant)
66. 14-Apr-2023 ORDERED: Appellant/Mother's Unopposed Motion For Enlargement Of Reply Brief (Appellant) = GRANTED. Due date EXTENDED from Friday, 04-21-2023 to Monday, 05-22-2023. If the brief is not timely filed, the court will submit this appeal for decision on the record and the filed briefs. Barbara Vidal Vaught ProTem Judge - Author
67. 1-May-2023 FILED: Appellant/Mother's Motion for Enlargement of Reply Brief; Mother's Motion for Enlargement [sic] of Reply Brief (Appellant)
68. 2-May-2023 FILED: Appellee's Response and Objection to Appellant's Motion for Enlargement of Reply Brief; Certificate of Service (Appellee)
69. 3-May-2023 ORDERED: Appellant/Mother's Motion for Enlargement of Reply Brief (Appellant) = GRANTED and allowing appellant to file a reply brief with up to 9,000 words. Hon Kent E Cattani - Author
70. 22-May-2023 FILED: Appellant's Reply Brief; Certificate of Compliance Re: Mother's Reply Brief; Certificate of Service Re: Mother's Reply Brief (Appellant)
71. 2-Jun-2023 FILED: Request for Oral Argument; Certificate of Service (Appellee)
72. 5-Jun-2023 ORDERED: Request for Oral Argument (Appellee) = GRANTED. Hon Kent E Cattani - Author

**Court of Appeals, Division One**

**Civil - Family Court**

**1 CA-CV 21-0661 FC**

**KUMBERA v. MANICKAM**

**84 PROCEEDING ENTRIES**

73. 28-Jul-2023 FILED: Notice of Oral Argument
74. 9-Aug-2023 CLNDR: MONTHLY COURT CASE CALENDAR, Department F, 9-28-23, 10:15 am, COURTROOM 2.
75. 21-Aug-2023 FILED: Notice of Substitution of Counsel; Certificate of Service; Exhibit A (Consent and Authorization Form) (Appellee)
76. 21-Sep-2023 FILED: Appellant's Motion to Continue Oral Argument for Good Cause; Certificate of Service Re: Mother's Motion to Continue Oral Argument for Good Cause (Appellant)
77. 22-Sep-2023 FILED: Return Receipt for Notice of Oral Argument, signed by Edward Jakob Walneck on 09/21/2023 (Appellee)
78. 22-Sep-2023 ORDERED: Appellant's Motion to Continue Oral Argument for Good Cause (Appellant) = GRANTED and vacating oral argument presently scheduled for 09/28/2023, and resetting oral argument in this matter on 11/30/2023, at 10:15 a.m. in Courtroom 1. Hon Jennifer B Campbell - Author
79. 27-Sep-2023 FILED: Notice of Oral Argument
80. 27-Nov-2023 FILED: Appellant's Motion to Continue Oral Argument Due to Counsel's Illness; Certificate of Service Re: Mother's Motion to Continue Oral Argument Due to Counsel's Illness (Appellant)
81. 27-Nov-2023 FILED: Return Receipt for Notice of Oral Argument, signed by Edward Walneck on 09/27/2023 (Appellee)
82. 28-Nov-2023 ORDERED: Appellant's Motion to Continue Oral Argument Due to Counsel's Illness (Appellant) = GRANTED, vacating oral argument presently scheduled for 11/30/2023, and resetting oral argument in this matter on 12/14/2023, at 10:15 a.m. in Courtroom 2. No further extensions will be granted for any reason. Hon Jennifer B Campbell - Author
83. 12-Dec-2023 FILED: Notice of Substitution of Counsel; Certificate of Service; Consent and Authorization (Appellee)
84. 14-Dec-2023 FILED: Sign-in Sheet/Case is Under Advisement as of 12/14/2023